MINUTES OF MEETING OF THE INDUSTRIAL COMMISSION OF ARIZONA

Held at 800 West Washington Street Conference Room 308 Phoenix, Arizona 85007 Thursday, July 13, 2017 – 1:00 p.m.

Present:

Dale L. Schultz

Chairman

Joseph M. Hennelly, Jr.

Vice Chair

Steven J. Krenzel

Commissioner (Telephonic)

James Ashley

Director

Jason M. Porter

Chief Legal Counsel

Renee Pastor William Warren Self-Insurance ADOSH Director

Phillip Murphy

ADOSH Assistant Director

Billie Gingrass Brian Downen Kara Dimas Compliance Officer
Compliance Officer
Commission Secretar

Commission Secretary

Chairman Schultz convened the meeting at 1:00 p.m. Also in attendance were Dave Howard with Premier Risk Management; Buddy Mitchell with M&P Venture Partners L.L.C.; and Jessica Aceves with Snell & Wilmer.

Approval of Minutes of June 29, 2017 Regular Meeting Minutes.

Commissioner Krenzel moved to approve the Minutes of the June 29, 2017 regular session meeting and Chairman Schultz seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz and Commissioner Krenzel voted in favor of the motion. Vice Chair Hennelly abstained. The motion passed.

Consent Agenda:

All items following under this agenda item are consent matters and will be considered by a single motion with no discussion unless a Commissioner asks to remove an item on the consent agenda to be discussed and voted on separately. The Commission may move into Executive Session under A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(2) to discuss records exempt by law from public inspection. Legal action involving a final vote or decision shall not be taken in Executive Session. If such action is required, then it will be taken in General Session.

a. <u>Approval of Proposed Civil Penalties Against Uninsured Employers.</u>

- 1. 2C16/17-2047 Carmagia Corporation dba Liquid Velvet Smokes, LP
- 2. 2C16/17-1232 Get Jets LLC., dba Kirby Home Care System
- 3. 2C16/17-1053 Joshua Holmes & Jennifer Holmes, Husband and Wife, dba Five Star Structures
- 4. 2C16/17-1989 South Mountain Boarding LLC (a pending corporation)
- 5. 2C16/17-1571 Titan Flooring Specialists, L.L.C.
- 6. 2C16/17-1794 Yarda Castellanos USA, LLC

b. Approval of Requests for Renewal of Self-Insurance Authority.

- 1. Hyatt Corporation
- 2. Knight Transportation, Inc.
- 3. Marriott International, Inc.
- 4. Mayo Clinic
- 5. Purcell Tire & Rubber Company

Chairman Schultz noted the favorable experience modification rating for Marriott International, Inc. and Mayo Clinic.

Chairman Schultz, Commissioner Krenzel, and Mr. Porter discussed whether any of the employers subject to proposed civil penalties had obtained insurance.

Vice Chair Hennelly moved to approve the Consent Agenda and Commissioner Krenzel seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, and Commissioner Krenzel voted in favor of the motion. The motion passed.

Discussion and Action of Arizona Division of Occupational Safety and Health Proposed Citations and Penalties.

Chairman Schultz discussed the purpose of and process for the Commission's consideration of ADOSH citations and proposed penalties.

M&P Venture Partners L.L.C.

7215 N 62ND Ave

Glendale, AZ 85301

Site Location:

15501 N Dial Blvd

Scottsdale, AZ 85260 A3807-1235301

Inspection No:

A3007-123330

Inspection Date:

05/26/2017

<u>SERIOUS</u> – Citation 1 - Item 1 – 15501 N Dial Blvd, Scottsdale, AZ 85260: Employees started demolition of a structure before a competent person performed an engineering survey to determine the condition of the framing, floors, walls and the possibility of an unplanned collapse of any portion of the structure. (29 CFR 1926.850(a)).

Div. Proposal - \$5,000.00

Formula Amt. - \$5,000.00

TOTAL PENALTY - \$5,000.00

TOTAL FORMULA AMT. - \$5,000.00

Complaint

Years in Business:

Empl. Covered by inspection:

6

7

Mr. Warren summarized the citation and proposed penalty and reviewed the photographs.

Vice Chair Hennelly, Commissioner Krenzel, Mr. Warren, and Ms. Gingrass discussed which employers were responsible for obtaining an engineering survey.

Vice Chair Hennelly, Mr. Warren, and Ms. Gingrass discussed the different site locations referenced in the inspection report.

Vice Chair Hennelly moved to approve the citation and proposed penalty as presented. Commissioner Krenzel seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, and Commissioner Krenzel voted in favor of the motion. The motion passed.

CW Builders, LLC

3260 N Hayden Rd., Ste 106

Unprogrammed Related

Years in Business:

20 1

Scottsdale, AZ 85251

Site Location: 1544

Emp. Covered by inspection: 15446 N Greenway, Hayden Loop

Scottsdale, AZ 85260

Inspection No:

A3807-1235631

Inspection Date:

05/26/2017

<u>SERIOUS</u> – Citation 1 - Item 1 – 15501 N Dial Blvd, Scottsdale, AZ 85260: Two employees of M & P Venture Partners Demolition, LLC initiated demolition of the two story structure and an engineering survey was not performed by a competent person to determine the conditions of the framing, floors and walls and the possibility of unplanned collapse of any portion of the structure prior to starting demolition activity. (29 CFR 1926.850(a)).

Div. Proposal - \$5,000.00

Formula Amt. - \$5,000.00

TOTAL PENALTY - \$5,000.00

TOTAL FORMULA AMT. - \$5,000.00

Mr. Warren summarized the citation and proposed penalty and noted that the photographs are the same as those discussed in M&P Venture Partners L.L.C. (Inspection No. A3807-1235301).

Commissioner Krenzel moved to approve the citation and proposed penalty as presented and Vice Chair Hennelly seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, and Commissioner Krenzel voted in favor of the motion. The motion passed.

O'Reilly Auto Enterprises, LLC

Referral

233 S Patterson Ave

Years in Business:

60

Springfield, MO 65802

Empl. Covered by inspection:

330

Site Location:

7000 W Latham St

Phoenix, AZ 85043

Inspection No:

A3807-1232832

Inspection Date:

05/16/2017

<u>SERIOUS</u> – Citation 1 - Item 1 – Warehouse: Employees worked in an area where a danger of foot injuries were present from falling or rolling automotive parts and the employer did not ensure the affected employees used protective footwear to prevent injury. (29 CFR 1910.136(a)).

Div. Proposal - \$5,000.00

Formula Amt. - \$5,000.00

TOTAL PENALTY -

\$5,000.00

TOTAL FORMULA AMT. - \$5,000.00

Mr. Warren summarized the citation and proposed penalty and reviewed the photographs.

Vice Chair Hennelly and Ms. Gingrass discussed whether the company was going to require protective footwear.

Chairman Schultz and Ms. Gingrass discussed the company's job evaluation checklist, the various products that is handles, and noted that its PPE requirements do not address footwear.

Commissioner Krenzel moved to approve the citation and proposed penalty as presented and Vice Chair Hennelly seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, and Commissioner Krenzel voted in favor of the motion. The motion passed.

Overson Roofing, LLC 842 E Isabella Ave., Ste 101 Referral

Years in Business:

12 4

Empl. Covered by inspection:

Site Location:

Mesa, AZ 85204

1533 S. 108th Way

Chandler, AZ 85286

Inspection No:

H9685-1232356

Inspection Date:

05/04/2017

<u>REPEAT SERIOUS</u> – Citation 1 - Item 1 – Overson Roofing, LLC, was previously cited for a violation of this occupational safety and health standard 1926.501(b)(11), which was contained in ADOSH inspection number 1138231, citation number (1), item number (1) and was affirmed as a final order on 7/14/2016, with respect to a workplace located at 1232 E Broadway Rd, Tempe, AZ 85282. (29 CFR 1926.501(b)(11)).

Div. Proposal - \$3,000.00

Formula Amt. - \$3,000.00

SERIOUS - Citation 2 - Item 1 -

a) 1533 S 108th Way Chandler, AZ 85286: Four employees were not protected by protective helmets while working on the job site where the danger of head injury existed when roof tiles were being stacked and stored within 6 feet of the roof edge and roofing materials were being thrown off of the roof to a trailer below. (29 CFR 1926.100(a)).

b) 1533 S 108th Way Chandler, AZ 85286: Roof tiles were stacked and stored within 6 feet of the roof edge on the north, south, and west portion of the roof. (29 CFR 1926.502(j)(7)(i)).

Div. Proposal - \$1,200.00

Formula Amt. - \$1,200.00

TOTAL PENALTY - \$4,200.00

TOTAL FORMULA AMT. - \$4,200.00

Mr. Warren summarized the citations and proposed penalties and reviewed the photographs.

Chairman Schultz and Mr. Downen discussed whether fall protection equipment was available on site, the tie offs used, the number of anchors available, and the materials' proximity to the edge.

Chairman Schultz, Commissioner Krenzel, and Mr. Downen discussed whether the company was aware of fall protection equipment and training requirements.

Vice Chair Hennelly moved to approve the citations and proposed penalties as presented and Commissioner Krenzel seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, and Commissioner Krenzel voted in favor of the motion. The motion passed.

Sunny Energy, LLC

Referral

2720 S Hardy Dr., Ste 4 Tempe, AZ 85282 Years in Business:

Empl. Covered by inspection:

2.5 6

17222 W Salome Rd

Site Location:

Goodyear, AZ 85338

Inspection No:

H9685-1229478

Inspection Date:

05/02/2017

 $\underline{SERIOUS}$ – Citation 1 - Item 1 – 17222 W Salome Rd, Goodyear, AZ 85338: Two employees were not protected by protective helmets while working below four solar panel installers where the danger

of head injury existed from falling reels of wire, reels of cable, tool equipment bags, a hand operated power drill, a hand operated power saw, tools, boxes of clips for the solar panels, and the solar panels themselves which weighed approximately 35 pounds each. (29 CFR 1926.100(a)).

Div. Proposal - \$1,250.00

Formula Amt. - \$1,250.00

<u>SERIOUS</u> – Citation 1 - Item 2 – 13279 W Ventura St, Surprise, AZ 85379: Five employees engaged in the installation of 30 solar panels on the roof a residential home were not protected from falling approximately 8 feet 10 inches to 26 feet to the ground below by the use of guardrail systems, safety net systems, or personal fall arrest systems. (29 CFR 1926.501(b)(13)).

Div. Proposal - \$1,250.00

Formula Amt. - \$1,250.00

<u>SERIOUS</u> — Citation 1 - Item 3— 17222 W Salome Rd, Goodyear, AZ 85338: Five employees engaged in solar panel installation were not provided a training program for each employee exposed to fall hazards approximately 8 feet to 26 feet to the ground below to enable each employee to recognize the hazards of falling and the procedures to be followed in order to minimize these hazards. (29 CFR 1926.503(a)(1)).

Div. Proposal - \$1,250.00

Formula Amt. - \$1,250.00

SERIOUS – Citation 1 - Item 4 –

- a) 17222 W Salome Rd, Goodyear, AZ 85338: A 16-foot Werner brand extension ladder, model D1116-2 MK17, was used to allow five employees to gain access to the roof a residential home and the ladder side rails did not extend at least 3 feet above the roof eave as they were only approximately 30 inches above the eave. (29 CFR 1926.1053(b)(1)).
- b) 17222 W Salome Rd, Goodyear, AZ 85338: A Werner brand 8 foot step ladder, model unknown, was used on top of the first story roof a residential home in the closed position and leaned against the second story roof eave to allow five workers to access the second story roof and back down to the first story roof. (29 CFR 1926.1053(b)(4)).

Div. Proposal - \$1,250.00

Formula Amt. - \$1,250.00

TOTAL PENALTY - \$5,000.00

TOTAL FORMULA AMT. - \$5,000.00

Mr. Warren summarized the citation and proposed penalties and reviewed the photographs.

Commissioner Krenzel moved to approve the citation and proposed penalties as presented and Vice Chair Hennelly seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, and Commissioner Krenzel voted in favor of the motion. The motion passed.

Discussion and/or action regarding Industrial Commission goals, objectives and key initiatives for 2017. This Agenda Item may include discussion regarding the Commission budget and review of <u>Division</u>, <u>Department</u>, and <u>Section specific objectives</u>.

Mr. Ashley discussed the upcoming Claims Seminar and noted that Senator Kimberly Yee and ADOA State Risk Manager Ray Di Ciccio will speak at the seminar.

He discussed an upcoming correctional facility tour in conjunction with Goal Council 4. Mr. Ashley provided an update concerning Goal Council 4, opportunities for released inmates to work in the construction industry, and providing OSHA "10-hour" classes to these soon-to-be-released inmates. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, and Mr. Ashley discussed tour details. Chairman Schultz commented that this is a wonderful way to work with a fellow agency on a project that also

meets stakeholder needs. Mr. Ashley echoed the need for additional workers in specific industries and noted Uber's partnership to help transport employees to worksites.

Mr. Ashley provided updates concerning Proposition 206, earned paid sick time inquiries, and the Commission's work to clarify the relevant statutes. He read a letter from PepsiCo thanking Labor Division Director Steve Welker and the Commission for its support. Chairman Schultz noted that Proposition 206 was an unfunded mandate that has required a countless amount of hours from the Commission and commented that the Commission's efforts were "terrific to see." Mr. Porter relayed a conversation with an attorney who said that Arizona has provided more guidance than any other state with earned paid sick time laws. Mr. Ashley mentioned the upcoming Proposition 206 proposed rulemaking oral proceeding and the transparency of the process.

Chairman Schultz and Mr. Ashley discussed the week's Gemba walk, the Claims Division's ability to eliminate its Form 104 backlog, the ALJ Division's further-hearing scheduling improvements, and the Legal Division Compliance Unit's improvements.

Mr. Ashley noted that the Payson Commission trip will take place August 30 and 31.

Announcements, Scheduling of Future Meetings and Retirement Resolutions.

Mr. Warren announced that Mr. Phil Murphy has been approved and appointed the new Assistant Director for ADOSH Compliance.

Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, Mr. Krenzel, and Ms. Dimas discussed Commission meeting dates through September 2017.

Public Comment.

ATTEST:

There was no public comment.

Vice Chair Hennelly moved to adjourn. Commissioner Krenzel seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, and Commissioner Krenzel voted in favor of the motion and the meeting adjourned at 1:54 p.m.

THE IND/USTRIAL COMMISSION OF ARIZONA

James Ashley, Director

 $\mathbf{R}_{\mathbf{v}}$

Kara Dimas, Commission Secretary