Chairman Schultz convened the meeting at 1:00 p.m. Also in attendance were Jeremy Bethancourt with Arizona ASSE; Dan Gorman and Jeff Gearhart with Gorman Roofing; Robert Taylor with OSHA; Stephanie Coulter with Cavanaugh Law Firm; and Jason Weber with Snell & Wilmer.

Approval of Minutes of November 17, 2016 Regular Meeting and November 17, 2016 Executive Session.

Commissioner LeMarr moved to approve the Minutes of the November 17, 2016 regular session meeting and Vice Chair Hennelly seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, Commissioner LeMarr, and Commissioner Orchard voted in favor of the motion. The motion passed.

Commissioner Orchard moved to approve the Minutes of the November 17, 2016 executive session meeting and Commissioner LeMarr seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, Commissioner LeMarr, and Commissioner Orchard voted in favor of the motion. The motion passed.

Consent Agenda:

All items following under this agenda item are consent matters and will be considered by a single motion with no discussion unless a Commissioner asks to remove an item on the consent agenda to be discussed and voted on separately. The Commission may move into Executive Session under A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(2) to discuss records exempt by law from public inspection. Legal action involving a final vote or decision shall not be taken in Executive Session. If such action is required, then it will be taken in General Session.

a. Approval of Proposed Civil Penalties Against Uninsured Employers.
1. 2C13/14-1995  Damian Harte, a single man, & Constance McCool, and single woman, dba The Great Alaskan Bush Company
2. 2C16/17-0258  Cabinets 4 Less, LLC
3. 2C15/16-0868  Value Truck of AZ, Inc.

b. Approval of Requests for Renewal of Self-Insurance Authority.

1. The Proctor & Gamble Company

Commissioner LeMarr moved to approve the items on the Consent Agenda and Vice Chair Hennelly seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, Commissioner LeMarr, and Commissioner Orchard voted in favor of the motion. The motion passed.

Presentation from and/or discussion with the Industrial Commission’s Public Information Officer. This agenda item may include discussion regarding the operations of the Industrial Commission.

Mr. Charles discussed pending legislative proposals, issues related to minimum wage and Proposition 206, and a Tucson media inquiry.

Mr. Charles discussed a partnership between ADOSH and the American Subcontractors Association of Arizona, Vantage West’s SHARP certification, Verco Decking’s VPP recertification, the ASU alliance, and Kitchell’s VPP status.

Mr. Charles commented on the pending State of the ICA and noted that he has been in regular contact with the Governor’s Office’s outreach division.

Chairman Schultz, Commissioner LeMarr, Commissioner Orchard, Mr. Ashley, and Mr. Charles discussed the Commission’s role in legislative discussions concerning presumptions for firefighters and peace officers, the role of related unions, and the relevant committee of reference.

Chairman Schultz noted that five more employers plan to join VPP next year.

Field Operation Manual Inspection Scope (Opening and Closing Conferences) Discussion.

Chairman Schultz, Commissioner LeMarr, Commissioner Orchard, Mr. Warren, and Mr. Brandon discussed Opening and Closing Conferences in the ADOSH inspection process, various employment types, processes for investigating discrimination and whistleblowing complaints, the role of the ADOSH consultation section, relevant timelines, and resolution options.

Discussion and Action regarding Final Rulemaking to amend Arizona Administrative Code to A.A.C. R20-5-629 adopting Federal Occupational Safety and Health standards in Recordkeeping Improving Tracking of Workplace Injuries and Illnesses.

Mr. Warren summarized the pending rulemaking and related procedure.

Commissioner LeMarr moved to direct ADOSH to prepare and file a notice of final rulemaking with the Office of the Attorney General and, if the Attorney General approves, to file the notice of final rulemaking with the Arizona Secretary of State. Vice Chair Hennelly seconded the motion. Chairman
Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, Commissioner LeMarr, and Commissioner Orchard voted in favor of the motion. The motion passed.

Discussion and Action of Arizona Division of Occupational Safety and Health Proposed Citations and Penalties.

Chairman Schultz discussed the purpose of and process for the Commission’s consideration of proposed ADOSH citations and proposed penalties.

Scotia Group Management, L.L.C.  
6340 N. Campbell Ave., Suite 170  
Tucson, AZ 85718  

Fatality/Accident  
Years in Business: 32  
Empl. Covered by inspection: 7

Site Location: 7425 N. Mona Lisa Rd.  
Tucson, AZ 85741  

Inspection No: E5149-1162945  
Inspection Date: 07/15/2016

SERIOUS – Citation 1 - Item 1 – HVAC Unit, Apartment #168, Desert Shadow Apartments, Tucson, AZ: The employer did not assess the electrical hazards associated with the HVAC work (live electrical motors) that would require the use of proper personal protective equipment (PPE) such as gloves. (29 CFR 1910.132(d)(2)).

Div. Proposal - $7,000.00  
Formula Amt. - $7,000.00

SERIOUS – Citation 1 - Item 2 – HVAC Unit, Apartment #168, Desert Shadow Apartments, Tucson, AZ: The employer did not ensure that the maintenance employee was following the company’s written lockout/tagout procedures that include de-energizing equipment while performing the service and maintenance on an energized air conditioning unit, employee training and annual inspections of the procedures. (29 CFR 1910.147(c)(1)).

Div. Proposal - $7,000.00  
Formula Amt. - $7,000.00

SERIOUS – Citation 1 - Item 3 – HVAC Unit, Apartment #168, Desert Shadow Apartments, Tucson, AZ: The maintenance employee who performed the service and maintenance on the energized air-conditioning unit was not trained or qualified as an electrician. (29 CFR 1910.332(b)(2)).

Div. Proposal - $7,000.00  
Formula Amt. - $7,000.00

TOTAL PENALTY - $21,000.00  
TOTAL FORMULA AMT. - $21,000.00

Mr. Warren summarized the citation and proposed penalties and reviewed the photographs provided by the Pima County Sherriff’s Office.

Commissioner LeMarr and Mr. Warren discussed Photograph 4, the depicted electrical boxes, and the injured employee’s level of electrical experience.

Chairman Schultz noted the weather at the time of the subject incident and its potential role in the incident.

Commissioner LeMarr moved to approve the citation and proposed penalties as presented and Commissioner Orchard seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, Commissioner LeMarr, and Commissioner Orchard voted in favor of the motion. The motion passed.
Dean Baldwin Painting Limited Partnership,  
a Texas Corporation  
1658 S Litchfield Rd  
Goodyear, AZ  85338  

Site Location: 1658 S Litchfield Rd  
Goodyear, AZ  85338  

Inspection No: J7272-1170193  
Inspection Date: 08/16/2016  

SERIOUS – Citation 1 - Item 1 –

a) Painting Operations: Employer monitoring revealed employee exposures to chromium (VI) to be at or above the action limit; however, the employer did not perform periodic monitoring at least every six months. (29 CFR 1910.1026(d)(2)(iii)).

b) Painting Operations: While washing aircraft of paint debris containing chromium (VI), the employer did not ensure that employees used personal protective equipment to prevent contact with the skin and eyes. (29 CFR 1910.1026(h)(1)).

c) Painting Operations: The employer did not ensure that chromium (VI) contaminated protective clothing and equipment was not removed from the workplace as employees would wear street clothes within the regulated area and exit with them. (29 CFR 1910.1026(h)(2)(ii)).

d) Painting Operations: The employer allowed consumption of food and drink within a chromium (VI) regulated area while the area and surfaces were not maintained as free as practicable of chromium (VI). (29 CFR 1910.1026(i)(4)(ii)).

e) Painting Operations: The employer did not ensure that all surfaces were maintained as free as practicable of accumulations of chromium (VI). (29 CFR 1910.1026(j)(1)(i)).

f) Painting Operations: The employer did not make medical surveillance available for all employees who were or could be occupationally exposed to chromium (VI) at or above the action level for 30 or more days a year. (29 CFR 1910.1026(k)(1)(i)(A)).

Div. Proposal - $4,500.00  
Formula Amt. - $4,500.00  
TOTAL PENALTY - $4,500.00  
TOTAL FORMULA AMT. - $4,500.00

Mr. Warren summarized the citation and proposed penalty and reviewed the photographs.

Chairman Schultz, Commissioner LeMarr, Commissioner Orchard, Mr. Warren, Mr. Brandon, and Mr. Shaffer discussed the subject inspection, the relevant conditions and exposures, the employer’s processes, the relationship of the inspection to an affiliated company, a related EPA inspection, the closing conference, and abatement.

Chairman Schultz asked Mr. Ashley to put this matter on a follow-up list for a future Commission meeting.

Commissioner Orchard and Mr. Brandon discussed the recommended citation and Commission Orchard complimented Mr. Brandon on his work.

Chairman Schultz and Mr. Brandon discussed the inspectors’ use of protective equipment.
Commissioner Orchard moved to approve the citation and proposed penalty as presented and Commissioner LeMarr seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, Commissioner LeMarr, and Commissioner Orchard voted in favor of the motion. The motion passed.

Diamond Plastics Corporation
1086 N. Thornton Rd.
Casa Grande, AZ 85122

Referral
Years in Business: 9
Empl. Covered by inspection: 12

Site Location: 1086 N. Thornton Rd.
Casa Grande, AZ 85122
Inspection No: N7988-1172153
Inspection Date: 08/05/2016

SERIOUS – Citation 1 - Item 1 –

(i) Clear the machine or equipment of tools and materials in accordance with paragraph (e)(1) of this section; (29 CFR 1910.147(f)(1)).

(ii) Remove employees from the machine or equipment area in accordance with paragraph (e)(2) of this section; (29 CFR 1910.147(f)(1)).

(iii) Remove the lockout or tagout devices as specified in paragraph (e)(3) of this section; (29 CFR 1910.147(f)(1)).

(iv) Energize and proceed with testing or positioning; (29 CFR 1910.147(f)(1)).

(v) Deenergize all systems and reapply energy control measures in accordance with paragraph (d) of this section to continue the servicing and/or maintenance. (29 CFR 1910.147(f)(1)).

(a) Facility: The sequence of actions were not followed as required when employees were engaged in the changeover on a 624 GLP Beller Machine (Serial Number 4516). (29 CFR 1910.147(f)(1)).

Div. Proposal - $5,000.00
Formula Amt. - $5,000.00
TOTAL PENALTY - $5,000.00
TOTAL FORMULA AMT. - $5,000.00

Mr. Warren summarized the citation and proposed penalty and reviewed the photographs.

Commissioner LeMarr and Mr. Warren discussed stored energy issues and lock-out/tag-out procedures.

Commissioner Orchard and Mr. Warren discussed the date of injury and the date of inspection.

Vice Chair Hennelly moved to approve the citation and proposed penalty as presented and Commissioner LeMarr seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, Commissioner LeMarr, and Commissioner Orchard voted in favor of the motion. The motion passed.

Gorman Roofing Services, Inc.
2229 E University Dr
Phoenix, AZ 85034

Referral
Years in Business: 18
Empl. Covered by inspection: 7

Site Location: 8330 N 19th Ave
Phoenix, AZ 85021
Inspection No: H9685-1169492  
Inspection Date: 08/11/2016

REPEAT-SERIOUS – Citation 1 - Item 1 – Montelano Apartments Building One: Three employees engaged in roofing activities on a 5:12 to 7:12 steep pitched roof with unprotected sides were not protected from falling approximately 28 feet to the ground below by guardrail systems with toeboards, safety net systems, or personal fall arrest systems. (29 CFR 1926.501(b)(11)).

Gorman Roofing Services, Inc. was previously cited for a violation of this Occupational Safety and Health Standard 1926.501(b)(11), which was contained in OSHA inspection number 1115517, citation number 1, item number 1 and was affirmed as a final order on June 3, 2016, with respect to a workplace located at 8330 N 19th Ave, Phoenix, AZ 85021. (29 CFR 1926.501(b)(11)).  
Div. Proposal - $4,000.00  
Formula Amt. - $4,000.00

REPEAT-SERIOUS – Citation 1 - Item 2 – 8330 N 19th Ave, Phoenix, AZ 85021: The employer did not provide a training program for five employees who were exposed to a fall hazard of 28 feet to the ground below to enable each employee to recognize the hazards of falling and the procedures to be followed in order to minimize these hazards. (29 CFR 1926.503(a)(1)).

Gorman Roofing Services, Inc. was previously cited for a violation of this occupational safety and health standard 29 CFR 1926.503(a)(1), which was contained in OSHA inspection number 1093169, citation number 1, item number 2 and was affirmed as a final order on August 1, 2016, with respect to a workplace located at 1735 NW Grand Ave, Phoenix, AZ 85007.  
Div. Proposal - $8,000.00  
Formula Amt. - $8,000.00

SERIOUS – Citation 2 - Item 1 – Item 1 –

a) 8330 N 19th Ave, Phoenix, AZ 85021: Five employees exposed to hazardous MasterSeal NP1 high performance polyurethane sealant did not have access to a safety data sheet at the workplace for the product nor was the safety data sheet immediately available through electronic access. (29 CFR 1910.1200(g)(8)).

b) 8330 N 19th Ave, Phoenix, AZ 85021: Five employees exposed to hazardous dust from dry cutting concrete roof tiles did not have access to a safety data sheet at the workplace for the product nor was the safety data sheet immediately available through electronic access. (29 CFR 1910.1200(g)(8)).

c) 8330 N 19th Ave, Phoenix, AZ 85021: One employee exposed to hazardous MasterSeal NP1 high performance polyurethane sealant and respirable health hazards from dry cutting concrete roof tiles did not receive effective information and training on the hazards associated with using the products. (29 CFR 1910.1200(h)(1)).  
Div. Proposal - $2,000.00  
Formula Amt. - $2,000.00

SERIOUS – Citation 2 - Item 2 –

a) 8330 N 19th Ave, Phoenix, AZ 85021: The employer did not provide a medical evaluation to five employees to determine the employee's ability to use a respirator, before the employees were required to use the respirator in the workplace while dry cutting concrete roof tiles with portable masonry saws. (29 CFR 1910.134(c)(1)).
b) 8330 N 19th Ave, Phoenix, AZ 85021: The employer did not ensure five employees passed the appropriate qualitative fit test (QLFT) or quantitative fit test (QNFT) prior to requiring them to wear negative pressure filtering facepiece respirators while dry cutting concrete roof tiles with portable masonry saws. (29 CFR 1910.134(f)(1)).

c) 8330 N 19th Ave, Phoenix, AZ 85021: Five employees who were required to wear negative pressure filtering facepiece respirators while dry cutting concrete roof tiles with portable masonry saws were not provided comprehensive, understandable training. (29 CFR 1910.134(k)).

### Div. Proposal - $2,000.00
Formula Amt. - $2,000.00

**SERIOUS – Citation 2 - Item 3 – North Side of Building 1:** The side rails on an aluminum straight ladder, manufacturer and model unknown, did not extend to at least 3 feet above the roof gable to which the ladder was used to gain access and a grasping device was not provided to assist one employee in mounting and dismounting the ladder. (29 CFR 1926.1053(b)(1)).

### Div. Proposal - $2,000.00
Formula Amt. - $2,000.00

**TOTAL PENALTY - $18,000.00**
**TOTAL FORMULA AMT. - $18,000.00**

Mr. Warren summarized the citations and proposed penalties and reviewed the photographs.

Commissioner Orchard, Commissioner LeMarr, and Mr. Warren discussed Citation 1, the presence of a training program, the subject safety equipment, and employee interviews.

Vice Chair Hennelly and Mr. Warren discussed the penalty calculation.

Mr. Gorman and Mr. Gearhart discussed the company’s safety policies, safety equipment, and procedures. Mr. Gorman noted that roofers feel it is safer to move around without having to manipulate a safety rope. He indicated that the subject crew and superintendent were terminated.

Mr. Gorman and Mr. Warren discussed training records.

Chairman Schultz discussed the employer’s culture of safety, encouraged the employer to engage with ADOSH, asked Mr. Warren to give consideration to the provision of fall-protection equipment, and stated that he could not condone the subject safety risks. Mr. Gorman noted agreement with Chairman Schultz’s statement.

Chairman Schultz discussed the benefits of the roofer’s alliance.

Commissioner Orchard, Mr. Warren, and Mr. Gearhart discussed training records.

Chairman Schultz discussed the information available to an employer once a citation is issued.

Commissioner LeMarr and Mr. Warren discussed the benefit of the roofer’s alliance.

Commissioner LeMarr moved to delete Citation 1, Item 2; re-classify Citation 2 as Non-Serious; reduce the Citation 2, Item 1 penalty to $500; reduce the Citation 2, Item 2 penalty to $500; and delete Citation 2, Item 3 — for a total penalty of $5,000. Commissioner Orchard seconded the motion. Vice Chair Hennelly discussed the motion. Commissioner LeMarr and Commissioner Orchard voted in favor of the motion. Chairman Schultz and Vice Chair Hennelly voted against the motion. The motion did not pass.
Vice Chair Hennelly moved to reduce the Citation 1, Item 2 penalty to $4,000; reduce the Citation 2, Item 1 penalty to $500; reduce the Citation 2, Item 2 penalty to $500; and reduce the Citation 2, Item 3 penalty to $1,000 — for a total penalty of $10,000. Chairman Schultz seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz and Vice Chair Hennelly voted in favor of the motion. Commissioner LeMarr and Commissioner Orchard voted against the motion. The motion did not pass.

Chairman Schultz discussed an amended motion.

Commissioner Orchard and Mr. Warren discussed resolution options after issuance of a citation and penalty.

Commissioner Orchard moved to re-classify Citation 2 as Non-Serious; reduce the Citation 1, Item 1 penalty to $2,500; reduce the Citation 1, Item 2 penalty to $1,000; reduce the Citation 2, Item 1 penalty to $500; reduce the Citation 2, Item 2 penalty to $500; and reduce the Citation 2, Item 3 penalty to $250 — for a total penalty of $4,750. Commissioner LeMarr seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz, Commissioner LeMarr, and Commissioner Orchard voted in favor of the motion. Vice Chair Hennelly voted against the motion. The motion passed.

Pinto Creek Company, L.L.C.
24004 S Norman Road
Eloy, AZ 85131

Site Location: 24004 S Norman Road
Eloy, AZ 85131

Inspection No: F3875-1159887
Inspection Date: 07/05/2016

Referral
Years in Business: 25
Empl. Covered by inspection: 8

SERIOUS – Citation 1 - Item 1 – Conveyors Systems: Employee did maintenance work on the conveyor system, and the employer did not establish a program consisting of energy control procedures and employee training to ensure that the equipment would be isolated and rendered inoperative prior to any work where the unexpected energizing or start up could occur and cause injury. A maintenance man placed his hand between the moving belt of the conveyor system to clean out mud and dirt and got his hand/arm caught in the conveyor system. (29 CFR 1910.147(c)(1)).

Div. Proposal - $2,000.00
Formula Amt. - $2,000.00

SERIOUS – Citation 1 - Item 2 –

a) Potato Conveyors: The rollers on the potato conveyors were not adequately guarded. (29 CFR 1910.212(a)(1)).

Div. Proposal - $1,750.00
Formula Amt. - $1,750.00

SERIOUS – Citation 1 - Item 3 –

a) Behind conveyor system lane 1: Where the truck drivers stand while unloading the potatoes there was two rows and on each row there was two junction boxes that did not have covers. (29 CFR 1910.305(b)(1)).
b) Behind conveyor system lane 2: Where the truck drivers stand while unloading the potatoes there was two rows and on each row there was two junction boxes that did not have covers. (29 CFR 1910.305(b)(1)).

Div. Proposal - $1,750.00  
Formula Amt. - $1,750.00

NON-SERIOUS -- Citation 2 - Item 1 -- Warehouse: The employer failed to contact ADOSH within 24 hours after the in-patient hospitalization of an employee that was injured when he got his hand caught in the conveyor system when he went to remove dirt and mud. (29 CFR 1904.39(a)(2)).

Div. Proposal - $2,750.00  
Formula Amt. - $2,750.00

TOTAL PENALTY - $8,250.00  
TOTAL FORMULA AMT. - $8,250.00

Mr. Warren summarized the citations and proposed penalties and reviewed the photographs.

Commissioner LeMarr and Mr. Warren discussed injury notification.

Vice Chair Hennelly and Mr. Warren discussed the cause of injury and photographs 4 and 6.

Commissioner LeMarr and Mr. Warren discussed what the subject machinery's purpose.

Commissioner Orchard, Commissioner LeMarr, and Mr. Warren discussed photographs 1 and 4.

Commissioner LeMarr moved to approve the citations and proposed penalties as presented and Vice Chair Hennelly seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, Commissioner LeMarr, and Commissioner Orchard voted in favor of the motion. The motion passed.

Commissioner LeMarr and Mr. Warren discussed the subject employer and its operations.

Arizona Division of Occupational Safety and Health Citation and Penalty updates.

Mr. Ashley discussed the nature of this agenda item.

Mr. Warren provided updates on the following matters:

- W0250-1111256 (U.S. Foods, Inc.)
- B7667-1098615 (Artistic Paver Mfg.)
- U9805-1114348 (Able Engineering and Component Services, Inc.)
- A3807-1143250 (Hale's Roofing, LLC)

Commissioner LeMarr and Mr. Warren discussed the Artistic Paver Manufacturing matter.

Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, and Mr. Ashley noted the benefit of the update.

Discussion and/or Action regarding the Consideration of Candidates for the Administrative Law Judge position, discussion regarding interview questions, selection for second interviews, and the salary. The Commission may move into Executive Session under A.R.S. §§ 38-431.03(A)(1), (A)(2), and (A)(3)
to obtain legal advice and to discuss the candidates, the interview questions, and the salary.

Vice Chair Hennelly moved to enter executive session. Commissioner Orchard seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, Commissioner LeMarr, and Commissioner Orchard voted in favor of the motion. The motion passed. Chairman Schultz announced the Commission would move into executive session.

The Commission returned to regular session at 4:08 p.m.

Vice Chair Hennelly moved to authorize Judge Mosesso to make an employment offer to candidate #3 and that Judge Mosesso have discretion to offer a salary within the posted salary range. Commissioner LeMarr seconded. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, Commissioner LeMarr, and Commissioner Orchard voted in favor of the motion. The motion passed.

Discussion and/or action regarding Industrial Commission goals, objectives and key initiatives for 2016. This Agenda Item may include discussion regarding the Commission budget and review of Division, Department, and Section specific objectives.

Mr. Ashley discussed the Commission’s online forms and the number and type of submissions.

Mr. Ashley discussed staffing in the Labor Division. Chairman Schultz complimented Lisa Padgett on her presentation to Tucson ADOSH concerning child labor laws.

Mr. Ashley noted that Mr. Charles will be updating the website’s minimum wage references and that the Legal Division is working on FAQs.

Mr. Ashley discussed the Interested Parties Portal launch.

Chairman Schultz discussed his favorable impressions of the Commissioners’ Gemba walk. Mr. Ashley commented on the good job being done by Division Managers, Supervisors, and staff. Commissioner Orchard noted that the engagement was impressive. Chairman Schultz commented positively on the huddle boards in Tucson.

Announcements, Scheduling of Future Meetings and Retirement Resolutions.

Ms. Dimas confirmed Commission meeting dates through January 2017. Commissioner Orchard will not be available for the December 15 meeting.

Chairman Schultz and Mr. Ashley discussed locations for the Commission’s quarterly meetings away from Phoenix.

Mr. Ashley and Commission Orchard discussed issues related to liaison changes at ASIA.

Public Comment.


Commissioner LeMarr and Mr. Bethancourt discussed Drive Smart Arizona’s educational aims.
Commissioner LeMarr moved to adjourn and Vice Chair Hennelly seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, Commissioner LeMarr, and Commissioner Orchard voted in favor of the motion and the meeting was adjourned at 4:26 p.m.

THE INDUSTRIAL COMMISSION OF ARIZONA

By

James Ashley, Director

ATTEST:

Kara Dimas, Commission Secretary